

Five Views on Development: How News Agencies Cover the UN Millennium Development Goals

C. Anthony Giffard
and Nancy Van Leuven

Department of Communication
University of Washington
Seattle, WA 98195

giffard@u.washington.edu
nancyvl@u.washington.edu

INTRODUCTION

Let's be straight about it – we share this small and fragile planet with a growing number of our fellow human beings. What happens in one country increasingly affects those who live in other countries. We will not have a safe and secure world unless we do something about poverty, injustice and inequality. We can do something. And it is the media – the mirror that we hold up to ourselves – that has an enormously powerful part to play in helping to make this happen, both in what we call ‘the North’, and in ‘the South’ where so many people bear the brunt of poverty. -- Hilary Benn, UK Secretary of State for International Development ¹

The *Millennium Declaration*, adopted by 189 world leaders in 2000 and implemented by the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs), sent a clear message. For the first time, international leaders had committed themselves to a worldwide campaign encompassing eight specific goals and with an absolute deadline. The MDGs are the first truly global effort to eradicate poverty. If they are successfully implemented by the year 2015, the projected benefits are staggering: 30 million children will not die before the age of five; more than 300 million will not suffer from hunger; more than 500 million people will not live in extreme poverty; 350 million fewer people will be without safe drinking water; and 650 million fewer people will live without basic sanitation measures.² Specifically, the full list of the MDGs is:

- Eradicate extreme poverty and hunger;
- Achieve universal primary education;
- Promote gender equality and empower women;
- Reduce child mortality;
- Improve maternal health;
- Combat HIV/AIDS, malaria, and other diseases;
- Ensure environmental sustainability; and
- Develop a global partnership for development.

Each goal has its own set of targets and benchmarks that offer a measurable way to track its implementation. The MDGs are a mandate for developing countries to shape policies and strengthen their own governance. More wealthy countries are asked to increase aid, relieve debt, and give poor countries fair access to their markets and technology.

¹ Benn, Hilary, at the BBC-World Service Trust/DFID conference, November 24, 2004.

<http://www.dfid.gov.uk/news/files/speeches/sp-hilarymedia24nov04.pdf> (Accessed October 17, 2005)

² UN Millennium Project 2005. Investing in Development: A Practical Plan to Achieve the Millennium Development Goals. Overview. Washington D.C.: Communications Development Inc.

This challenge springs from decades of debate over how nations might work together to form long-term strategies for a global social agenda. The UN first heralded the 1960's as the "Development Decade," but its efforts stalled when organizations did not communicate with each other or monitor progress.³ The post-Cold War era offered a number of similar campaigns which also dissolved due in part to a lack of accountability measures. However, a series of UN Conferences in the 1990s renewed the international commitment to development goals. One catalyst was the 1995 World Summit for Social Development in Copenhagen, where leaders vowed to eradicate global poverty. During the 2000 United Nations Millennium Summit they agreed to set a time frame for combating poverty, hunger, disease, illiteracy, environmental degradation and discrimination against women. An independent advisory body was commissioned to identify MGD strategies and monitor their progress. The panel, directed by Professor Jeffrey Sachs and staffed by more than 265 experts from the public and private sector, released "Investing in Development," a blueprint for attaining the MDGs, in January, 2005. In addition, the MDGs were the focus of the *Human Development Report 2003*, which urged the adoption of a "Millennium Development Compact" to better mobilize development resources.⁴ More than 80 developing countries have prepared reports on their progress toward attaining the MDGs. UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan noted in a report on *Implementation of the United Nations Millennium Declaration* that:

In four short years, the eight Millennium Development Goals . . . have transformed the face of global development cooperation. The broad global consensus around a set of clear, measurable and time-bound development generated unprecedented, coordinated action, not only within the United Nations system . . . but also within the wider donor community, and most importantly, within developing countries themselves.⁵

However, indications are that at present rates of progress, many countries may fall short of the goals.

THE PRESENT STUDY

One lesson that has been learned from efforts to promote development is the necessity of communication at all levels. This is true not only of people and organizations directly involved in development projects, but also of wider communities whose understanding and support is essential if programs are to succeed. That is where the mass media have an important role. News agencies in particular have a significant contribution to make. They are the wholesalers of news. Few newspapers, broadcast outlets or on-line media have the resources needed to cover

³ Bissio, Roberto. (2003) "Civil Society and the MDGs," Leelananda De Silva and Shawna Tropp (eds.) *UNDP Development Policy Journal*, (3)

⁴ United Nations Development Programme (2003). *Human Development Report 2003*, New York: Oxford University Press.

⁵ United Nations (2004). *Implementation of the United Nations Millennium Declaration, Report of the Secretary General*, General Assembly A/59/282. Washington D.C.: United Nations.

multinational fora where key discussions take place and decisions are made. The news agencies essentially set the agenda for public discussion. They largely determine what issues will be covered, and whose voices will be heard.

Many studies of international communication have as their theoretical base such constructs as imperialism, modernization and globalization. The findings generally demonstrate an imbalance in news flow, with core nations more likely to be covered than the periphery. People quoted or mentioned in news agency reports are disproportionately nationals of elite nations. They tend to be government officials rather than civil society, and predominantly male. Conflicts among countries or regions get more attention than cooperative endeavors.

The MDGs differ from most international issues that engender tensions and disputes. The goals transcend national and regional boundaries and have the endorsement of virtually every country. The plans to reduce poverty, hunger, disease, child mortality, illiteracy, environmental degradation, and discrimination against women by 2015 are directly relevant to the needs of developing nations -- especially Africa. Others are equally relevant to developed nations -- such as the prospect of ensuring global environmental sustainability, human rights, security and ultimately world peace. Such conflicts as do arise generally deal not with the goals as such, but the means of achieving them. Nevertheless, there are differences of opinion about, among other things, as to how they should be funded.

METHOD

This study is intended to determine the amount and kind of information available to traditional media and on-line readers from five international news agencies. It examines the overall coverage and also the similarities and differences among the five agencies with respect to the people, organizations and issues mentioned in their dispatches about MDGs. The analysis includes:

- **News Geography:** What cities were the reports filed from, and which nations and geographic regions were mentioned most frequently?
- **Actors:** Which people were accorded the most attention, and what were their nationalities, gender, and spheres of activity?
- **Organizations:** What organizations were represented -- governments, United Nations, NGOs, or others?
- **MDGs:** Which of the eight goals, and which subtopics in those goals, figured most prominently in the coverage?

The agencies included in the study were selected for analysis after a search of the Lexis/Nexis database for reports about the MDGs identified a handful of agencies that provided the most extensive coverage. Two are Western -- France's Agence France-Presse and the New York-based Associated Press. Two are based in developing regions - PANAPRESS (formerly the PanAfrican

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

News Agency) headquartered in Dakar, and China's Xinhua news agency, with headquarters in Beijing. The fifth is Inter Press Service which, while its administrative headquarters are in Rome, has a decentralized network with bureaus in all the major regions. The five agencies therefore represent a global sample of coverage that includes perspectives of both developed and developing countries. All of these agencies offer services in multiple languages. Only the English-language feeds are included in the study.

AGENCE FRANCE-PRESSE (AFP), founded in 1835, bills itself as the world's oldest news agency. AFP has journalists in 165 countries and five regional headquarters. There are bureaus in 110 nations and local correspondents in 50 more. AFP has particularly good coverage of Europe, Francophone Africa and those parts of Asia with strong links to France.

ASSOCIATED PRESS (AP), founded in 1848, is one of the world's largest news agencies. AP operates as a not-for-profit cooperative, with 3,700 employees working in more than 240 worldwide bureaus. It serves more than 5,000 television/radio stations and 1,700 newspaper members in the United States, and reaches 8,500 international subscribers.

INTER PRESS SERVICE (IPS), established in 1964, describes itself as an independent voice from the South and the only global, daily news service that offers in-depth, independent coverage on issues of global interest, including development. It has bureaus in every region, and has particularly good coverage of Latin America.

PANAPRESS, founded in 1979 as the PanAfrican News Agency, offers extensive coverage of Africa. It has stringers and correspondents in 51 countries. PANAPRESS prides itself on providing subscribers an indigenous outlook about crucial African issues rather than relying on outside news agencies.

XINHUA is the state and worldwide news agency of the People's Republic of China, employing over 10,000 people. It has 150 subsidiaries all over China and the world. Founded in 1931, this news agency reports directly to the Chinese Communist Party's Propaganda Department.

The study encompasses the period January 1, 2004 to September 15, 2005, a time bracketed by two significant events: the World Social Forum in January, 2004, and the UN Summit in 2005, which affirmed the commitment of developed nations to fund the MDGs. The year 2005 was singled out by UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan as a "make-or-break moment for the world's poor," because of the critical opportunities for world leaders to decide on concrete actions to implement the MDGs, such as a meeting of the UN General Assembly in June, the G-8 Summit in July and the UN World Summit in September.

The texts analyzed in this study were downloaded from news agency web sites and from the Lexis/Nexis database. To be selected, news reports had to include the words "Millennium Development Goals" or "MDG" in their headlines or texts. This yielded a total of 2,171 reports:

Table 1: Number of reports and number of words per story

AGENCY		AFP	AP	IPS	PANA	XINHUA
NUMBER OF REPORTS		260	297	422	476	716
NUMBER OF WORDS		137050	173048	382904	197063	265364
AVERAGE STORY LENGTH		527	583	907	414	370

Xinhua and PANA had the largest numbers of reports, but IPS reports were, on average, considerably longer and together comprised the largest number of words -- almost a third of the total (Table 1). The two Western agencies had extensive coverage of the UN, but tended to focus on such issues as the need for organizational reforms and allegations of malfeasance in the award of oil contracts, rather than the development goals. Unless the reports mentioned MDGs they were not included in our files.

TextPack PC⁶ content analysis software was used to determine the source of each report, using datelines to identify what cities the reports were filed from. The cities were grouped by nation and geographic region. To determine which nations were covered, we computed how many UN member states were mentioned, and how often their names appeared in the reports. The nations were grouped by such variables as their region and income per capita.

The name of every person mentioned in the reports was entered into a database that included gender, nationality, position, organizational affiliation, and sphere of activity. When duplicates were removed this yielded a list of 1,798 individuals. Lists of the names together with various attributes such as nationality were matched against the news agency texts. We counted both the number of actors and the number of times their names appeared - the latter a measure of the prominence they were accorded. So a single actor would be counted once in the total number of actors, but multiple times in frequency of mention. For example, Kofi Annan, Tony Blair and George Bush count as three actors, but each was mentioned numerous times across the five agencies: Annan (1,294), Blair (426) and Bush (348).

To quantify the amount of attention paid to the various goals, we analyzed documents on the official MDG websites and also the news agency reports themselves, and compiled lists of keywords relating to each goal. Computers then counted the frequency of each keyword in the agency texts and compiled the results into categories. To check the validity of the coding scheme we coded a sample of the reports manually and compared the results with the computerized analysis. The keyword dictionaries were modified if there were discrepancies. Similar dictionaries were used to determine the frequency of mention of organizations.

⁶ Textpack PC: Zentrum fuer Umfragen, Methoden und Analysen, Mannheim (1998).

FINDINGS

DATELINES

Table 2: Number of cities from which reports were filed, by region

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
REGION										
AFRICA	23	26.1	7	17.5	10	16.9	45	86.5	25	33.8
EUROPE	27	30.7	13	32.5	15	25.4	3	5.8	16	21.6
ASIA	24	27.3	9	22.5	11	18.6	0	0.0	21	28.4
LATIN AMERICA	2	2.3	2	5.0	11	18.6	1	1.9	3	4.1
NORTH AMERICA	4	4.5	2	5.0	4	6.8	2	3.8	2	2.7
MIDEAST	3	3.4	1	2.5	2	3.4	0	0.0	5	6.8
OCEANIA	3	3.4	4	10.0	1	1.7	0	0.0	0	0.0
CARIBBEAN	1	1.1	1	2.5	4	6.8	0	0.0	1	1.4
UN	1	1.1	1	2.5	1	1.7	1	1.9	1	1.4
TOTAL	88	100.0	40	100.0	59	16.9	52	100.0	74	100.0

The cities from which reports are filed can be an important factor in what perspectives are made part of public discourse. We examined the datelines on reports, noting the cities from which they were filed, and categorizing the cities by nation, region, and level of development as measured by their status in the World Bank's ranking of nations by gross national income per capita. The purpose was to determine whether a variety of perspectives were represented, North and South, East and West, rich and poor. For the purpose of this analysis, the United Nations was listed as a nation.

As Table 2 illustrates, AFP is particularly strong in Europe, but also in Francophone Africa and Asia where France has long had important interests. Xinhua was strongly represented in Africa and Asia, and somewhat less so in Europe. PANA had an exceptionally large number of reports from African cities, but very few from anywhere else. IPS, although it had fewer different datelines than AFP or Xinhua, had proportionately the most balanced geographical representation. Its coverage included numerous reports from Latin American cities -- a region largely ignored by the other agencies. Several IPS reports about the MDGs were composite analyses from correspondents in various regions.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Table 3: Number of reports by region

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
REGION										
AFRICA	57	22.3	25	11.4	40	9.7	428	91.5	278	38.8
EUROPE	79	30.9	101	46.1	136	32.9	12	2.6	78	10.9
ASIA	32	12.5	20	9.1	36	8.7	0	0.0	212	29.6
UN	43	16.8	14	6.4	93	22.5	22	4.7	108	15.1
NORTH AMERICA	33	12.9	39	17.8	41	9.9	6	1.3	22	3.1
LATIN AMERICA	9	3.5	3	1.4	56	13.6	0	0.0	10	1.4
MIDEAST	3	1.2	1	0.5	2	0.5	0	0.0	7	1.0
OCEANIA	0	0.0	14	6.4	1	0.2	0	0.0	0	0.0
CARIBBEAN	0	0.0	2	0.9	8	1.9	0	0.0	1	0.1
TOTAL	256	100.0	219	100.0	413	100.0	468	100.0	716	100.0

Analysis of the number of reports filed from cities in each region -- as opposed to the number of cities they were filed from -- reveals a different ranking (Table 3). PANA and Xinhua had the largest number of reports from Africa. IPS and Xinhua had large numbers from the UN. IPS had the most reports from Europe -- partly because of a large number of stories that dealt with European Union development policy. The G-8 summit in Scotland also boosted European coverage. Of the 78 reports with Latin American datelines, 56 were from IPS correspondents.

Table 4: Cities from which most reports were filed

	AFP	AP	IPS	PANA	XINHUA
1	UN	UN	UN	DAKAR	UN
2	WASHINGTON	LONDON	BRUSSELS	NAIROBI	BEIJING
3	LONDON	WASHINGTON	LONDON	ADDIS ABABA	NAIROBI
4	TOKYO	GENEVA	WASHINGTON	MAPUTO	MANILA
5	NAIROBI	NEW YORK	NAIROBI	ACCRA	ADDIS ABABA
6	GENEVA	JOHANNESBURG	BANGKOK	UN	HARARE
7	BANGKOK	CANBERRA	RIO DE JANEIRO	BRAZZAVILLE	ABUJA
8	PARIS	PARIS	BERLIN	COTONOU	GENEVA
9	LUXEMBOURG	LOS ANGELES	JOHANNESBURG	ABUJA	LAGOS
10	SINGAPORE	DAVOS	NEW YORK	BISSAU	LUSAKA
11	ABUJA	MANILA	BUENOS AIRES	CAPE TOWN	MAPUTO
12	HONG KONG	NAIROBI	GENEVA	OUAGADOUGOU	DHAKA
13	PORTO ALEGRE	BRUSSELS	MEXICO CITY	PARIS	KAMPALA
14	SYDNEY	CAPE TOWN	MONTEVIDEO	LUSAKA	WASHINGTON
15	ADDIS ABABA	AMSTERDAM	HELSINKI	NOUAKCHOTT	JAKARTA

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Four of the agencies clearly saw the United Nations in New York as the primary source of news about the MDGs (Table 4). However, PANA ranked the UN sixth, behind five African cities. Western cities provided the datelines for large numbers of reports -- particularly Washington, London, Geneva, Brussels and New York. Overall, however, there were more reports from cities in developing nations than the developed areas.

NATIONS

A common critique of news agency reporting is that "elite" nations -- and particularly the wealthy and powerful G-7 group -- monopolize the coverage. It is in bureaus in those nations that the great majority of agency correspondents are based. We checked if that was true also of our data set, in which every report referred to MDGs.

Table 5: Number of nations by geographic regions

AGENCY	IPS	%	XINHUA	%	AFP	%	AP	%	PANA	%
REGION										
AFRICA	47	27.6	46	32.9	43	31.2	33	26.4	47	43.9
EUROPE	40	23.5	29	20.7	29	21.0	32	25.6	20	18.7
ASIA	26	15.3	25	17.9	24	17.4	23	18.4	17	15.9
LATIN AMERICA	18	10.6	13	9.3	16	11.6	13	10.4	10	9.3
MIDDLE EAST	15	8.8	13	9.3	14	10.1	10	8.0	6	5.6
CARIBBEAN	13	7.6	4	2.9	6	4.3	5	4.0	3	2.8
OCEANIA	9	5.3	8	5.7	4	2.9	7	5.6	2	1.9
NORTH AMERICA	2	1.2	2	1.4	2	1.4	2	1.6	2	1.9
TOTAL	170	100.0	140	100.0	138	100.0	125	100.0	107	100.0

When measured by the number of nations that are mentioned in each region, the critique does not hold. There are more nations from Africa in the agency reports than those from any other region (Table 5). The figures are more a reflection of the number of nations in each -- 47 of the 53 African Union member states are mentioned by name at least once -- than the amount of attention they were accorded. The North American region comprises only two states -- the United States and Canada. IPS referred to the greatest number of nations in every category, as well as overall.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Table 6: Frequency of mentions of nations by region

AGENCY	IPS	%	XINHUA	%	AFP	%	AP	%	PANA	%
REGION										
AFRICA	808	19.0	1055	30.3	514	18.8	387	15.1	1857	80.4
ASIA	929	21.8	1498	43.1	549	20.1	528	20.6	106	4.6
EUROPE	1084	25.5	270	7.8	1005	36.8	796	31.0	204	8.8
N. AMERICA	470	11.0	374	10.8	380	13.9	385	15.0	77	3.3
LAT.AMERICA	673	15.8	93	2.7	89	3.3	117	4.6	37	1.6
MIDEAST	146	3.4	56	1.6	156	5.7	190	7.4	20	0.9
OCEANIA	36	0.8	119	3.4	18	0.7	128	5.0	3	0.1
CARIBBEAN	109	2.6	13	0.4	19	0.7	37	1.4	5	0.2
TOTAL	4255	100.0	3478	100.0	2730	100.0	2568	100.0	2309	100.0

Measured a different way, however, the rank order changes. Summing the number of times each nation is mentioned results in Europe ranking first on IPS, AFP and the AP. Xinhua favors Asia, then Africa. PANA has a heavy emphasis on Africa -- 80 percent of all mentions are to nations on that continent (Table 6). North America, although it comprises only two nations -- the United States and Canada -- garners substantial numbers of references, but usually fewer than Africa, Asia or Europe. Two-thirds of all mentions of Latin American nations are found in the IPS files, which had the largest number of mentions overall, and also the most balanced regional distribution. There were relatively few references to nations in three regions: the Middle East, Oceania and the Caribbean.

Table 7: Nations mentioned most frequently (all five agencies combined)

United States	1453	South Africa	277	Bangladesh	174	Cambodia	118
China	1204	Germany	273	Russia	171	Pakistan	108
France	856	Iraq	265	Zimbabwe	168	Rwanda	108
United Kingdom	691	Uganda	218	Mexico	148	Netherlands	102
India	499	Senegal	213	Sudan	148	Mali	100
Kenya	483	Ghana	200	Congo	144	Burkina Faso	97
Japan	383	Mozambique	194	Tanzania	131	Indonesia	97
Ethiopia	362	Zambia	192	Philippines	130	Sweden	96
Nigeria	305	Italy	182	Scotland	130	Thailand	95
Brazil	298	Canada	176	Australia	125	Spain	92

Examination of the number of references to individual nations in the combined files of the five agencies shows that of the top 10 countries mentioned, four are elite nations (Table 7). The United States heads that group, along with France, the United Kingdom and Japan. However, China, India and Kenya also rank high, as do other developing nations in the top 40 list.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

To distinguish between developed and developing countries, we used the World Bank's classification of nations by gross national income per capita. This indicator of economic development is set by dividing the dollar value of a country's annual output of goods by the size of its population. Not all countries appear on the World Bank's list and so are not included.

Table 8: Number of nations by World Bank income categories

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
GNI PER CAPITA										
\$745 or less	57	38.0	49	38.3	62	33.7	50	44.2	55	36.2
\$746 – \$2975	38	25.3	30	23.4	53	28.8	27	23.9	46	30.3
\$2976 – \$9025	20	13.3	16	12.5	28	15.2	12	10.6	17	11.2
\$9026 or more	35	23.3	33	25.8	41	22.3	24	21.2	34	22.4
TOTAL	150	100.0	128	100.0	184	100.0	113	100.0	152	100.0

Across every agency there are more nations in the lowest income bracket (\$745 or less a year) than any other group (Table 8). Altogether 37.6 percent of the countries are in this cohort. The two lower groups together (income \$745 or less to \$2,975) comprise 64.3 percent of the overall total. PANA and Xinhua had a slightly higher proportion of nations in the two lower groups, but IPS mentioned more countries in those categories than any other agency.

Table 9: Frequency of mention of nations by World Bank income categories

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
GNI PER CAPITA										
\$745 or less	687	32.3	654	27.0	1249	30.6	1690	74.8	1280	41.7
\$746 – \$2975	476	22.4	544	22.5	952	23.3	274	12.1	1208	39.3
\$2976 – \$9025	111	5.2	73	3.0	406	9.9	91	4.0	154	5.0
\$9026 or more	851	40.0	1149	47.5	1481	36.2	204	9.0	430	14.0
TOTAL	2125	100.0	2420	100.0	4088	100.0	2259	100.0	3072	100.0

Data on the number of times nations are mentioned (Table 9) show that the proportions of nations in the upper and lower brackets are similar to the distribution by numbers of nations in Table 8. One difference is that the nations with the highest per capita income (\$9,026 or more) were mentioned more frequently than their numbers would predict. The 34 countries in the top bracket accounted for 22.4 percent of the number of nations, but 29.5 percent of the number of mentions, indicating that there was some bias toward the "elites." The number of mentions also is a measure of the depth of coverage by the five agencies. The five together had a total of 13,964 mentions of various nations. Of these, 4,088 were in IPS reports -- 29.2 percent of the total. Xinhua was second at 22 percent, followed by the AP at 17.3 percent, PANA at 16.2 percent and AFP at 15.2 percent. This is a result, in part of, the greater length of the IPS reports.

ORGANIZATIONS

When news media report on complex global issues such as poverty it is important that they provide a platform for a wide range of voices. Inevitably people in positions of power and influence will get more coverage. But in addition to the movers and shakers, a discussion of the MDGs ideally would reflect the views of those people those directly affected -- the poor, the hungry, the illiterate, the sick, the oppressed. Given the fact that every one of the MDGs is of considerable interest and significance to women -- including poverty, education, gender equality, maternal and child health, and HIV/AIDS -- their voices should be heard.

We should know also what organizations are working in the field -- both government and non-government. Media coverage of NGOs can have an impact not only on their image but on their success in fund-raising. NGOs have become major players at the huge UN summits over the past couple of decades -- on the environment, population, food, women, information societies, to name a few. While they have their own channels of communication, they also rely on news media -- increasingly those that are available on-line, such as the agencies covered in this study - - for networking and learning what is happening in their fields. To know more about the types of actors affiliated with the MDGs, we have examined the kind of people who are mentioned in the reports.

Every actor was categorized by nationality, geographic region, gender, organizational affiliation (if any), and position in that organization. We are thus able to determine who the news agencies considered newsworthy, especially in the context of development. At the institutional level, we examined both NGOs and UN agencies involved in Millennium projects. The NGOs are those that appear in one or more agencies. We listed those mentioned by each agency, then ran a combined list against the output of all five agencies. UN sources provided lists of specialized agencies that we likewise ran against the reports -- using both the full names and abbreviations of each.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Table 10: Coverage of NGOs

AGENCY	IPS	PANA	XINHUA	AFP	AP
NUMBER OF NGOs	154	43	38	30	14
MENTIONS OF NGOs	588	94	108	101	91

IPS covered the highest number of NGOs, 154 in all. (See Appendix 1 for complete IPS list.)

Table 11: Frequently mentioned NGOs

IPS		PANA	
Oxfam	111	Advance Africa	10
CONCORD (European development groups)	21	Stop TB	9
Eurostep	19	Africa Action	6
Africa Action	14	Action Aid	4
War on Want	13	Global Forum	4
CIDSE - Cooperation for Development	12	Oxfam	4
Jubilee USA	12	Zimbabwe Sanitation Collaborative Council	4
Society for International Development	12	Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy	3
Global Call to Action Against Poverty	10	Global Call to Action Against Poverty	3
Population Institute	10		
Earth Institute	9	AFP	
SCN – Sustainable Communities Network	9	Oxfam	25
Amnesty International	8	Action Aid	8
Caritas	8	Greenpeace	5
Education for All	8	Stop the War	4
Save the Children	8	Amnesty International	3
Brookings Institution	7	Helsinki Group	3
International Confederation of Free Trade Unions	7	Human Rights Watch	3
Third World Network	7	Transparency International	3
Euforic	6	Global Call to Action Against Poverty	2
XINHUA		AP	
Education for All	5	Oxfam	31
Green Revolution	5	Amnesty International	16
Inter-Parliamentary Union	5	Live Aid	11
African Capacity Building Foundation	5	Alan Guttmacher Institute	6
Asia-Europe Meeting	4	Earth Institute	6
CPAFFC	4	World Vision	5
Oxfam	3	Global Forum	4
Chinese Academy of Social Sciences	3	Maryknoll Office for Global Concerns	4

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Global Call to Action Against Poverty		Save the Children	3
---------------------------------------	--	-------------------	---

Altogether, 206 NGOs were mentioned by name across the five agencies (Table 11). The 20 with the highest number of mentions were, in order, Oxfam, Amnesty International, Africa Action, Eurostep, Global Call for Action Against Poverty, Earth Institute, Action Aid, Education for All, Jubilee USA, Global Forum, International Planned Parenthood, Sustainable Communities Network, War on Want, CDSE, Live Aid, Save the Children, Society for International Development, Transparency International and World Vision.

Table 12: frequency of mention of UN specialized agencies

AGENCY	IPS	XINHUA	PANA	AFP	AP	TOTAL
ORGANIZATION						
World Bank	293	212	153	182	157	997
World Health Organization	48	172	308	36	30	594
UN Development Program	98	121	201	29		405
UN Children's Fund	101	84	104	44	11	344
UN Food and Agriculture Organization	25	39	81	9	4	158
UN Environment Program	12	52	6	32		156
International Labor Organization	30	32	15	32	7	116
UN Population Fund	48	12	38			98
International Fund for Agricultural Development	48		26	8	1	83
UN Conference on Trade and Development	36	35	1	6		78
World Food Program	11	30	31	2		74
UN Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization	29	12	15	2		58
International Development Association	10	18	18	2		48
UN Human Settlements Program		2	42	3		47
Joint UN Program on HIV/Aids	13	5	10	11	7	46
UN Economic and Social Council	21	9			4	34
UN Development Fund for Women	9		4			13
UN International Trade Center		8				8
UN Framework Convention on Climate Change	1	3	6			5
UN High Commissioner for Refugees	3		1	1		5
UN Industrial Development Organization			1	4		5
TOTAL	836	846	1061	403	221	3372

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

References to the United Nations in general topped the list for all five agencies with total of 3,328 mentions (Table 12). Among specialized UN agencies, the World Bank led with 997 mentions, then the World Health Organization (WHO, 594), United Nations Development Programme (UNDP, 478), United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF, 344), UN Food and Agriculture Association (FAO, 160), United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP, 126), International Labour Organization (ILO, 116), International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD, 83), United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTD, 84), United Nations World Food Programme (WFP, 75), United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO, 61), United Nations Human Settlements Programme (HABITAT, 47), the Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS, 46) and United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM, 13). IPS reports included the highest number of mentions of UN organizations, followed by Xinhua, PANA, AFP and AP.

ACTORS

Table 13: Number of actors by nationality (top 20 only)

AFP	#	AP	#	IPS	#	PANA	#	XINHUA	#
UN	72	UN	48	UN	128	UN	124	UN	106
USA	45	USA	41	USA	89	USA	31	CHINA	41
UK	25	UK	35	UK	49	KENYA	24	USA	19
SOUTH AFRICA	10	SOUTH AFRICA	11	BELGIUM	31	UK	22	KENYA	19
CHINA	9	AUSTRALIA	7	KENYA	28	MOZAMBIQUE	19	UK	16
BELGIUM	9	FRANCE	6	SOUTH AFRICA	25	GHANA	18	NIGERIA	15
KENYA	8	CHINA	5	BRAZIL	23	ETHIOPIA	16	ZAMBIA	15
NIGERIA	8	BRAZIL	5	INDIA	16	SENEGAL	16	MOZAMBIQUE	12
FRANCE	8	CANADA	4	ARGENTINA	14	SOUTH AFRICA	15	SOUTH AFRICA	12
SENEGAL	7	NIGERIA	3	NIGERIA	12	NIGERIA	11	BANGLADESH	12
GHANA	6	JAPAN	3	GERMANY	11	FRANCE	9	ZIMBABWE	11
JAPAN	6	GERMANY	3	CANADA	10	ZAMBIA	8	PHILIPPINES	10
BRAZIL	6	IRELAND	3	BOLIVIA	10	CONGO	8	GHANA	6
MALI	6	MOZAMBIQUE	3	CHINA	9	BRAZIL	7	UGANDA	6
GERMANY	5	PAKISTAN	3	MEXICO	9	MALI	7	JAPAN	6
IRELAND	5	INDIA	3	NETHERLANDS	8	BENIN	6	CAMBODIA	6
SWITZERLAND	5	ETHIOPIA	3	ITALY	8	BELGIUM	5	MALAYSIA	5
MOZAMBIQUE	4	NETHERLANDS	3	FRANCE	7	INDIA	5	ETHIOPIA	4
IVORY COAST	4	KENYA	2	PAKISTAN	7	GERMANY	5	FRANCE	4
PAKISTAN	4	IVORY COAST	2	FINLAND	7	UGANDA	5	GERMANY	4

People affiliated with the United Nations topped the list for each of the agencies (Table 13). Americans were second, followed by Britons. After that, however, were nationals of four developing nations -- Kenya, South Africa, China and Nigeria. Then came Belgium, followed by two more developing nations, Brazil and citizens of Mozambique.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Table 14: Number of actors by region

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
REGION										
AFRICA	96	26.7	38	15.6	111	17.1	214	46.3	123	28.6
UN	69	19.2	51	21.0	128	19.7	119	25.8	105	24.4
EUROPE	74	20.6	63	25.9	138	21.2	57	12.3	50	11.6
ASIA	44	12.3	24	9.9	80	12.3	24	5.2	104	24.2
NORTH AMERICA	43	12.0	44	18.1	98	15.1	33	7.1	21	4.9
LATIN AMERICA	17	4.7	9	3.7	71	10.9	11	2.4	11	2.6
MIDEAST	7	1.9	5	2.1	9	1.4	1	0.2	10	2.3
OCEANIA	5	1.4	8	3.3	6	0.9	3	0.6	2	0.5
CARIBBEAN	4	1.1	1	0.4	10	1.5		0.0	4	0.9
TOTAL	359	100.0	243	100.0	651	100.0	462	100.0	430	100.0

The rank order of actor in regions was similar across the agencies, with most from Africa, the UN, and Europe (Table 14). IPS had the largest number of actors, with 651 people referred to at least once, and over twice as many Caribbean actors. Latin American nationals are notably underrepresented, except in the case of IPS, which included several Brazilians, among others.

Table 15: Frequency of mention of actors, by region

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	&	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
REGION										
UN	625	34.7	687	30.1	1014	31.4	679	37.6	859	35.7
ASIA	164	9.1	121	5.3	229	7.1	41	2.3	666	27.7
AFRICA	282	15.6	242	10.6	338	10.5	712	39.4	497	20.7
EUROPE	296	16.4	550	24.1	705	21.8	230	12.7	229	9.5
NORTH AMERICA	332	18.4	541	23.7	556	17.2	108	6.0	79	3.3
MIDEAST	30	1.7	19	0.8	21	0.7	1	0.1	39	1.6
LATIN AMERICA	57	3.2	21	0.9	305	9.4	27	1.5	26	1.1
OCEANIA	7	0.4	87	3.8	18	0.6	10	0.6	7	0.3
CARIBBEAN	10	0.6	18	0.8	43	1.3		0.0	4	0.2
TOTAL	1803	100.0	2286	100.0	3229	100.0	1808	100.0	2406	100.0

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

When one counts how often the actors from each agency are mentioned (Table 15), it is clear that UN officials were quoted more frequently than other cohorts. PANA was an exception, favouring Africans. IPS mentioned Latin American actors more often than the other agencies.

To determine the sphere of activity of the actors, we coded them into five categories:

- **Government**, which included all state officials, from heads of states and diplomats to members of local legislatures. Prominent actors in this category are UK Prime Minister Tony Blair, US President George W. Bush, and the French President Jacques Chirac;
- **United Nations**: Anyone identified as being affiliated with the UN or its agencies.
- **NGOs**: Non-profit, civil society groups. The World Bank defines NGOs as, “private organizations that pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote the interests of the poor, protect the environment, provide basic social services, or undertake community development”. This category includes well known organizations such as Oxfam, Greenpeace, and Amnesty International as well as small groups in developing nations.
- **Citizens**: The people-in-the-street, workers, students, entertainers and artists with opinions about the MDGs. This category was bolstered by the coverage of several concerts and celebrity-related events; thus, this grouping includes citizens such as Bono, and Bob Geldof. These well-known personalities accounted for a large proportion of actors in the "citizen" category.
- **Experts**: People knowledgeable about some aspect of the MDGs, including academics, business leaders and analysts not identified as members of other categories.

Table 16: Number of actors by sphere of activity

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
SPHERE										
GOVERNMENT	134	37.3	90	37.0	196	30.1	178	38.5	197	45.8
UNITED NATIONS	101	28.1	60	24.7	155	23.8	110	23.8	119	27.7
NGO	74	20.6	61	25.1	225	34.5	108	23.4	75	17.4
CITIZENS	31	8.6	18	7.4	31	4.8	38	8.2	16	3.7
EXPERTS	19	5.3	14	5.8	45	6.9	28	6.1	23	5.3
TOTAL	359	100.0	243	100.0	652	100.0	462	100.0	430	100.0

Overall, the largest category for four of the agencies was Government, followed by the UN (Table 16). The exception was IPS, which featured NGO-affiliated people more often than any other sphere, and had twice as many actors from NGOs than any other agency. IPS also had the highest number of experts. XINHUA had the highest proportion of government actors. Across the board, ordinary citizens and independent experts were outnumbered by government and UN officials, and to a lesser extent by representatives of NGOs.

Table 17: Frequency of mention of actors by sphere of activity

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
SPHERE										
GOVERNMENT	822	45.6	900	39.4	1144	35.4	556	30.8	903	37.5
UNITED NATIONS	579	32.1	857	37.5	935	28.9	647	35.8	1021	42.4
NGO	254	14.1	349	15.3	833	25.8	366	20.2	314	13.1
CITIZENS	89	4.9	106	4.6	181	5.6	136	7.5	66	2.7
EXPERTS	59	3.3	74	3.2	138	4.3	103	5.7	102	4.2
TOTAL	1803	100.0	2286	100.0	3231	100.0	1808	100.0	2406	100.0

When one counts how often actors were mentioned by sphere of activity (Table 17), the ranking is the same as that of their numbers in Table 16. However, while government officials comprise 46 percent of the number of actors, they account for only 37 percent of mentions. UN officials, who together number 28 percent of all actors, account for 35 percent of mentions. This indicated that UN officials were mentioned proportionately more frequently than their absolute numbers would indicate. The converse is true of government actors.

Table 18: Number of actors by World Bank income categories

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
INCOME LEVEL										
\$745 or less	100	34.5	37	19.0	137	26.0	196	57.3	144	44.0
\$746 – \$2975	47	16.2	33	16.9	100	19.0	39	11.4	90	27.5
\$2976 – \$9205	13	4.5	6	3.1	38	7.2	10	2.9	15	4.6
\$2906 or more	130	44.8	119	61.0	252	47.8	97	28.4	78	23.9
TOTAL	290	100.0	195	100.0	527	100.0	342	100.0	327	100.0

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Given MDG aims, it is interesting to know whether the voices of the poor -- the major stakeholders in the debate -- are being heard (Table 18). Nearly 55 percent of all actors were from the two lower levels of the GNI index (\$745 or less to \$2,975). PANA and Xinhua both had high numbers from low-income countries -- nearly 69 percent in the case of PANA and 71.5 percent in Xinhua -- which reflected their emphasis on African and Asian news. The corresponding AFP figure was 50 percent, for IPS 45 percent and for AP 35 percent.

Table 19: Frequency of mention of actors by World Bank income categories

AGENCY	AP	%		AFP	%		IPS	%		PANA	%	XINHUA	%
INCOME LEVEL													
\$745 or less	321	27.2		367	22.9		412	18.5		667	59.1	576	37.2
\$746 - \$2975	166	14.1		221	13.8		407	18.3		111	9.8	581	37.5
\$2976 - \$9205	71	6.0		44	2.7		147	6.6		53	4.7	40	2.6
\$9205 or more	622	52.7		973	60.6		1258	56.6		297	26.3	351	22.7
TOTAL	1180	100.0		1605	100.0		2224	100.0		1128	100.0	1548	100.0

The proportion of actors from low-income nations drops when one measures the number of times they were mentioned as opposed to their absolute numbers (Table 19). While the overall number of actors in the two lower categories was about 55 percent, their combined frequency of mention was 50 percent of the total. People from nations in the two upper levels (\$2,976 - \$9,205 or more) accounted for 45 percent of the total number, but 50 percent of the number of mentions. The difference is not large but is statistically significant and reflects the prominence accorded to the rich and powerful. Despite that, however, compared to studies of news agency coverage of other issues, the inclusion of about 50 percent of actors from the lower income levels is remarkably high.

Table 20: Most frequently mentioned names (top 20 only)

AFP	#	AP	#	IPS	#	PANA	#	XINHUA	#
Annan	271	Annan	281	Annan	236	Annan	108	Annan	398
Wolfowitz	87	Blair	239	Bush	133	Tibaijuka	51	Hu	81
Blair	71	Bush	156	Michel	94	Samba	42	Obasanjo	54
Wolfensohn	56	Bolton	68	Sachs	55	Blair	41	Chino	46
Bush	50	Chirac	65	Herfkens	51	Sambo	39	Blair	33
Bolton	41	Sachs	54	Obaid	48	Chissano	36	Arroyo	31
Ping	33	Makhubela	50	Blair	46	Toepfer	33	Wen	31
Obasanjo	30	Snow	45	Chirac	28	Wade	31	Toepfer	30
Toepfer	20	Howard	43	Fornos	27	Guebuza	27	Chirac	23
Sachs	18	Gordon Brown	35	Nielson	26	Amoako	27	Sachs	22
Chirac	16	Ping	33	Stocker	25	Obasanjo	24	Malik	21
Gordon Brown	16	Piot	30	Lula	24	Jong-wook	18	Kim	19
Kim	14	Geldof	29	Ping	23	Obaid	18	Kuroda	19
Inacio	12	White	23	Wolfensohn	23	Mbeki	17	Mbeki	17
Lula da Silva	12	Rice	23	Ocampo	23	Benn	17	Wolfowitz	17
Mugabe	12	Patterson	18	Barroso	23	Konare	15	Jintao	17
Somavia	12	Rudd	18	Bolton	22	Oye Mba	14	Liu	17
England	11	Wolfensohn	17	Lagos	21	Diouf	13	Mugabe	16
King Gyanendra	11	England	17	Reindorp	20	Omar	12	Zeng	15
Penn	11	Jones	17	Malloch Brown	19	Gawanas	12	Obaid	15

There is no doubt who the Newsmaker of the Year was, at least in this context. UN Secretary-General Kofi Annan was the top choice for all five agencies by a large margin (Table 20). After that, the lists vary, with some overlap. The five most frequently mentioned people on each agency are almost all senior UN officials or political leaders.

AP chose Annan, followed by British Premier Tony Blair; US President George Bush; John Bolton, US Ambassador to the UN; Jacques Chirac, President of France; and Prof. Jeffrey Sachs, director of the UN Millennium Project.

AFP's list, after Annan, was Paul Wolfowitz, president of the World Bank; Tony Blair; James Wolfensohn, former president of the World Bank; Bush; Bolton, and Jean Ping, president of the UN General Assembly.

IPS chose Annan; Bush; Louis Michel, EU commissioner for Development and Humanitarian Aid; Sachs; Eveline Herfkens, UN coordinator for MDGs; and Thoraya Obaid, executive director of UNFPA.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

PANA favored Annan, Anna Tibaijuka, director of UN-HABITAT; Ebrahim Samba, regional director for WHO; Blair; Ebrahim Samba, former WHO regional director for Africa; Luis Sambo, WHO regional director for Africa; and Joaquim Chissano, former president of Mozambique.

XINHUA, after Annan, favoured Jintano Hu, president of China; Olesengun Obesanjo, president of Nigeria; Tadao Chino, head of the Asian Development Bank; and Gloria Arroyo, president of the Philippines.

Much has been written about how gender equality applies to the Millennium Development Goals and how the goals seek to reverse poverty's devastating effect on women. The UN declares that every Goal is directly related to women's rights, which effectively expands women's issues beyond maternal, sexual, and reproductive topics. It is important, therefore, to examine the ways media frame such issues to the public, especially since media are important agents of socialization, including issues that contest or support constructions of culture and gender.⁷ One way to explore the framework of social change is to study how women are portrayed in media, such as whether coverage prefers one gender over another, as seen in the table below.

Table 21: Number of female and male actors included in reports

AGENCY		AP	AP%		AFP	%		IPS	%		PANA	%		XINHUA	%
GENDER															
MEN		299	83.5		195	80.6		465	71.2		364	79.0		370	86.0
WOMEN		59	16.5		47	19.4		188	28.8		97	21.0		60	14.0
TOTAL		358	100.0		242	100.0		653	100.0		461	100.0		430	100.0

Over the five news agencies combined, men represent 79 percent of all actors. Individual agencies vary from a high of 86 percent of men on Xinhua to a low of 71 percent on IPS, which refers to 188 women by name -- nearly twice as many as any of the other agencies (Table 21).

⁷ Gill, Sonia. "Marginalization of Women in the Media." *UN Chronicle*. New York: Dec 2003-Feb 2004. 40 (4) p. 38.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Table 22: Frequency of mention of actors, by gender

AGENCY	AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
GENDER										
MEN	1612	89.5	2023	88.6	2475	76.6	1461	81.0	2159	89.7
WOMEN	190	10.5	261	11.4	757	23.4	343	19.0	247	10.3
TOTAL	1802	100.0	2284	100.0	3232	100.0	1804	100.0	2406	100.0

The differential treatment of men and women is noticeably more pronounced when one compares the number of women actors to the number of times they are mentioned. In every case, the percentage of mentions of women is lower than their numbers would predict (Table 22). On AP, the proportion of women drops from 16.5 percent to 10.5. On AFP it is from 19.4 percent to 11.4 percent. The drop is less precipitous in the case of PANA and Xinhua, but still is noticeable. On IPS, the proportion drops from 28.8 to 23.4 percent -- but remains considerably higher than any of the other agencies.

COVERAGE OF THE MDGs

Each goal was characterized by a list of relevant keywords. Analysis of the combined files of reports from all five agencies showed that some goals were accorded a much higher prominence than others, with the top-ranking four accounting for more than three-quarters of the total number of mentions of keywords (Table 23).

Table 23: Frequency of MDG keywords

AGENCY	IPS	%	XINHUA	%	PANA	%	AP	%	AFP	%	TOTAL	%
GOALS												
DEVT AID	4478	30.8	2981	32.9	1934	27.3	1689	35.9	1425	35.3	12507	31.7
POVERTY	2510	17.3	1792	19.8	1045	14.8	1084	23.0	905	22.4	7336	18.6
HIV/AIDS	1865	12.8	1411	15.6	1455	20.6	782	16.6	611	15.1	6124	15.5
ENVIRO	1537	10.6	1138	12.6	1031	14.6	390	8.3	479	11.9	4575	11.6
GENDER	1659	11.4	612	6.8	514	7.3	115	2.4	191	4.7	3091	7.8
EDUCAT	1348	9.3	558	6.2	369	5.2	367	7.8	209	5.2	2851	7.2
MATERNAL	740	5.1	356	3.9	485	6.9	136	2.9	95	2.4	1812	4.6
CHILDREN	387	2.7	215	2.4	246	3.5	144	3.1	125	3.1	1117	2.8
TOTAL	14524	100.0	9063	100.0	7079	100.0	4707	100.0	4040	100.0	39413	100.0

Goal 8: *Develop a Global Partnership for Development*, was the MDG that drew the most attention from the agencies' combined files. This category alone accounted for almost 32 percent of all references to keywords. It included such themes as an increase in development aid, improved terms of trade, and cancellation of debt for poor countries. The most frequent keywords were aid, development, debt, pledges and commitments, capital, donors, NGOs, and partnership.

Goal 1: *Eradicate Extreme Poverty and Hunger*, was second in terms of overall frequency of mention, with 18.6 percent of the combined total. The goal is reduce by half the proportion of people living on less than a dollar a day, and reduce by half the proportion of people who suffer from hunger. The word "poverty" alone appeared more than 2,300 times, and also occurred in strings such as extreme poverty, global poverty and abject poverty. The phrase "less than a dollar a day" likewise appeared frequently.

Goal 6: *Combat HIV/Aids, Malaria and Other Diseases* ranked third. There were almost 2,000 references to HIV/AIDS, AIDS, or HIV in the combined file. Malaria was mentioned 465 times, and tuberculosis or TB 215 times. The words disease, health care and epidemic also appeared often.

Goal 7, *Ensure Environmental Stability*, ranked fourth overall. Here the most common terms were climate and climate change, pollution, emissions, greenhouse gases, Kyoto Protocol, fuel and renewable energy.

Goal 3, *Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women*, was in fifth place. Frequent keywords were gender, equality and inequality, disparity and empowerment.

Goal 2, *Achieve Universal Primary Education*, was sixth, characterized by references to words or strings such as education, primary school, literacy and illiteracy, Education for All, universal education and school enrollment.

Goal 5, *Improve Maternal Health*, was seventh, with the most common keywords and phrases being maternal mortality, reproductive health, family planning, maternal health, birth control, pregnancy and contraception.

Goal 4, *Reduce Child Mortality*, in eighth place, had large numbers of references to words and strings like child mortality, child deaths, infant mortality, children under five, child survival, immunization and measles.

Analysis of the coverage by the individual agencies suggests that their priorities were generally similar. All paid more attention to development aid than any other goal -- an average of 36 percent of their total number of keywords. This is due in part to the complexity of that goal: it has more themes and hence more keywords than any other goal, and there is a correlation

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

between the number of keywords in each category and the number references we found. Four of the five agencies ranked Poverty/Hunger as second, HIV/AIDS as third and the environment as fourth.

However, there were large differences in the depth of the coverage. IPS carried the largest number of references to keywords – 14,524 in all, or 33.1 percent of the total number. Xinhua was second at 23.0 percent, then PANA at 17.1, AP at 15.0 and AFP at 11.9. This can be attributed to the fact that IPS reports on average were considerably longer, more closely focused on the MDGs and more detailed. than those of the other agencies. IPS stories average 907 words, compared to 583 for AP, 527 for AFP, 414 for PANA and 370 for Xinhua.

Table 24 : GOAL 1 themes

AGENCY		AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
POVERTY		741	81.9	928	85.6	1954	77.8	739	70.7	1366	76.2
HUNGER		164	18.1	156	14.4	556	22.2	306	29.3	426	23.8
GOAL 1 TOTAL		905	100.0	1084	100.0	2510	100.0	1045	100.0	1792	100.0

Factor analysis indicated that the keywords relating to four of the goals could be subdivided into discreet categories. Goal 1, Poverty and Hunger, divided logically into two subsets (Table 24). The keywords relating to poverty were three times as common as those relating to hunger. The most frequent keywords in the Poverty subset were "poverty" (4230 mentions), slums, dollar a day, unemployment and impoverishment. In the Hunger subset, that word occurred 1012 times, followed by food, malnutrition, food security/insecurity, starvation and famine.

Table 25 : GOAL 7 themes

AGENCY		AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
ENVIRONMENT		217	45.3	122	31.3	880	57.3	561	54.4	701	61.6
CLEAN WATER		108	22.5	146	37.4	320	20.8	353	34.2	238	20.9
GLOBAL WARMING		154	32.2	122	31.3	337	21.9	117	11.3	199	17.5
GOAL 7 TOTAL		479	100.0	390	100.0	1537	100.0	1031	100.0	1138	100.0

Goal 7, Environmental Stability, could be regarded as having four main themes: the environment in general, clean water, and global warming (Table 25). The environment subset included the word "environment", often in conjunction with "sustainable." Also in this subset were references to biodiversity, ecosystems, and ecology. The clean water subset led with "sanitation" and many terms linked to water, such as: safe, clean, potable, fresh, and running.

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

The global warming subset encompassed that phrase, along with references to climate change, greenhouse gases, emissions, deforestation, carbon dioxide, ozone and fossil fuels.

Table 26: GOAL 8 themes

AGENCY		AFP	%	AP	%	IPS	%	PANA	%	XINHUA	%
DEVELOPMENT AID		549	38.6	572	33.9	2167	48.4	962	49.7	1285	43.1
TERMS OF TRADE		355	24.9	359	21.3	924	20.6	397	20.5	961	32.2
DEBT RELIEF		315	22.1	457	27.1	799	17.8	273	14.1	356	11.9
GOOD GOVERNANCE		142	10.0	185	11.0	459	10.3	250	12.9	298	10.0
BAD GOVERNANCE		63	4.4	116	6.9	129	2.9	52	2.7	80	2.7
GOAL 8 TOTAL		1424	100.0	1689	100.0	4478	100.0	1934	100.0	2980	100.0

Goal 8 -- the largest category -- includes five themes we called Development Aid, Terms of Trade, Debt Relief, Good Governance and Bad Governance (Table 27). IPS, PANA and Xinhua paid proportionately more attention than AP or AFP to funding of development programs, while the latter agencies showed more interest in debt relief, and had a higher proportion of references to "bad" governance than the developing-country agencies.

The "Good Governance" subset related to the concept that development aid should be channeled preferentially to those nations that were characterized by respect for human rights, accountability, transparency, the rule of law, democracy, free elections and private enterprise. "Bad governance" was characterized by such terms, in order of frequency, as corruption, waste, bribery, graft, crime, mismanagement, fraud, incompetence, cheating and money-laundering. All agencies had more keywords relating to good governance than bad, BUT the AP and AFP paid proportionately more attention to bad governance.

The debate over good and bad governance was spurred by President Bush's call for "a new compact for global development, defined by new accountability for both rich and poor nations alike." Greater contributions from developed nations would be linked to greater responsibility from developing nations. Bush pledged that the United States would increase its core development assistance by 50 percent. The funds would go into a new Millennium Challenge Account (MCA) that would be "devoted to projects in nations that govern justly, invest in their people and encourage economic freedom."

The importance of this was largely overlooked by the news agencies we studied. Altogether, they carried 2,505 references to "Millennium Development Goals," 2970 to "MDGs," -- and 22 references to the Millennium Challenge Account (MCA). Sixteen of those were on IPS.



Here are some final observations about IPS and its MDG coverage.

In terms of general COVERAGE, IPS reports that mentioned MDGs:

- generally had the MDGs as their main topic. Many of the reports from other agencies mentioned the MDGs in passing, embedded in the body of articles that dealt primarily with something else;
- were, on average, considerably longer than those of the other agencies. Together they comprised almost a third of the total number of words, even though XINHUA and PANA had larger numbers of reports;
- IPS reports had space to examine the complex issues in depth.

In terms of GEOGRAPHY, IPS reports:

- displayed more balance in terms of the regions covered. It had the most extensive coverage of the United Nations, and like others, had a large proportion of reports from Europe, Africa, Asia, and North America. A major difference was its inclusion of numerous reports from Latin America -- a region largely ignored by the other agencies.
- were not biased towards one or other geographic region -- as was the case of PANAPRESS with its tight focus on Africa, or Xinhua with its primary interest in Asia.

In terms of ACTORS, IPS reports:

- included proportionately more actors from Latin America, Europe, and the Caribbean than the other agencies;
- Featured by far the highest number and proportion of women actors;
- mentioned more actors from poorer developing countries -- as measured by GNI per capita -- than any of the others;
- covered a far greater range of NGOs -- not only well-known international agencies but small, otherwise unrecognized groups in developing nations;
- had more references to UN organizations involved in promoting the MDGs than any other agency.

In terms of its coverage of the Millennium Development Goals, IPS reports:

- had by far the most in-depth coverage of the goals. Altogether 33.1 percent of all references to MDG keywords were found in the IPS stories;
- paid at least three times as much attention to issues of gender equality than the others.

A final note from researchers about accuracy: When coding actors for various attributes, our researchers found considerable inconsistency among agencies in titles and the spelling of names. When there was disagreement among the agencies, our team researched the correct titles. In almost every instance it was IPS that had it right.

Appendix 1: All NGOs mentioned in IPS reports

50 Years Is Enough Network	Berlin Institute for Population and Development
Action Against Hunger	
Action Aid	Bertelsmann Foundation
Africa 2000	BioThai
Africa Action	Birin Kebbi VVF Centre
Africa Center for Peace and Democracy	Boca Project
Africa Fighting Malaria	BOND International Development
Africa institute of South Africa	Brazilian Action for Nutrition and Human Rights
Africa Peace Forum	Brazilian Micro Enterprise and Small Business Support Service
African Forum and Network on Debt and Development	Brazilian Rural Association
African Institute for Agrarian Studies	Brussels-based European Policy Centre
Africa's Religious Leaders' Forum	Campaign for Tobacco Free Kids
Africa Woman Communications	Canadian Programme on Genomics and Global Health
Agronomic Institue of Campinas	Cariri New Deal project
Aids Epidemic	Caritas
All Nepal Peasants' Association	Carrefour
Alliance 2015	Catholic Church
Amazon Alliance	Catholic Relief Service
Amnesty International	Catholics for a Free Choice
Anglican Church	Cattle Farmers Federation of Santa Cruz
Argentine Political and Social Institute on Women	Center for Legislative Development
Argentine Workers Central	Central de Trabajadores Argentinos
Arya Samaj Society	Centre for Distributive, Labor and Social Studies
ANDI - Asociacion Nacional de Empresarios de Colombia	Centre for International Education
Association for Rural Advancement in South Africa	Centre for Justice and Human Rights
Association of Crisis Centres	Centre for Policy Studies in Johannesburg
Association of Traditional Chiefs of Niger	Centre for Reproductive Rights
Batay Ouvriye	Centre for Women's Global Leadership
	Centre of Action Research Studies
	Centre of World Solidarity

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Challenge Programme	Economic Justice Network of Fellowship of Christian Councils
Child Rights Committee	ECPAT
Childlife	Ecuadorian Populorum Progressio Fund
Chilean Health Network	Educational Action
Chittagong University	End Child Prostitution and Trafficking
Church of North India	Endangered Wildlife Trust
CIDSE	Enlaces América
Citizens Network on Essential Services	Environmental Defense
CNI Synod	Equality Now
Coalition for Food Aid	Essential Action
Coalition for the International Criminal Court	ETC Group
Coalition on AIDS	Ethos Institute
Comisiones Obreras	EU Institute for Security Studies
Committee for Debt Relief	Euforic
Computer Professionals	Europe Action Aid Alliance within CONCORD
Concern	European Network on Debt and Development
CONCORD	Eurostep
Confederation of African Medical Associations and Societies	Expo Brazil
Confederation of Communities Affected by Mining	FALP project
Confederation of Education Workers of the Republic of Argentina	Family Welfare
Confederation of Indigenous Nationalities of Ecuador	Farabundo Martí National Liberation Front (FMLN)
Confederation of South African Trade Unions	Feminist Center for Studies and Advice
Country Water Partnership	Ferzaneh magazine
Creative Group of Britain	Focus on the Global South
Debt and Globalisation Observatory	Foreign Policy in Focus
Disability Network	Forest Peoples Programme
Dochas	Forum for African Woman Educationalists
DRC Action Network on Small Arms and Light Weapons	Forum for African Women Educationalists
Earth Institute	Foster Parents Plan
Earth Policy Institute	Foundation for Human Rights
Earthwatch Institute	Friends of the Earth
Ecological Action	Friends of the United Nations
	Fundacion Iberoamericana para el desarrollo

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Fundación Polar's Vetiver	Institute for Global Studies
Fundación Tierra	Institute for Healthcare Improvement
Gandhi Peace Foundation	Institute for Policy Studies
Gay Association of Bahia	Institute for the Study of International Migration
Gender, Poverty and Employment programme	Interaction
German Institute for Economic Research	Interfarma
Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy	International Alliance of Inhabitants
Global AIDS Alliance	International Confederation of Free Trade Unions
Global Call to Action Against Poverty	International Economic Development Group
Global Forum	International Fund for Animal Welfare
Global Witness	International Planned Parenthood Federation
Globescan	International Water Management Institute
Grameen Bank	International Women's Health Coalition
Greek Social Forum	International Year of Microcredit
Green Revolution	IOM
Greenpeace	IPA
Hackney Environment Forum	IPPF/WHR
Halifax Initiative Coalition	Italian Peace Roundtable Association
Harris Bank	Ivorian Association for Family Health
Helsinki Group	Jamiatul Ulama
Human Rights Cities program	Joint Economic Committee
Human Rights Watch	Jubilee South
Humanist Institute for Cooperation with Developing Countries	Jubilee USA Network
Ibon Foundation	Kaiowá Indigenous Rights Commission
Igua Pui Genda	Kaiowá Indigenous Rights Commission
independent Women's National Committee	Kalima Magazine
India-Canada Collab HIV/AIDS	Kenya Adult Learners Association
Indian Institute of Management	Kenya National Union of Teachers
Indigenous Environmental Network	Kenya Treatment Access Movement
Indigenous Information Network	La Republica
Infact	Latin American social scientists' association
INFORM	FLACSO
Institute for Democracy in South Africa	LDC Watch
	Maiti Nepal

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Mamidipudi Vendatarangaiya Foundation	Our World Is Not for Sale
Marie Stopes International	Overseas Development Institute
Massive Effort Campaign	Oxfam
Matrika'	Pakistan's Women Development
Medical Federation	Pan-African Organisation of Women
Messengers of Peace	Partners In Health
Microcredit Summit Campaign	Peace and Human Rights Resource Centre
Mineral Policy Center	People's Health Movement
Misión Barrio Adentro	Pesticide Action Network
Molo Songololo	Piauí Rural Development Secretariat
MTL and Emetele Housing, Credit and Consumption Cooperative, Ltd.	Policies for Women
National Aids Control Council	Political Science Institute
National Aids Coordinating Committee	Population Action International
National Centre for Prevention of Sexually Transmitted Infections and HIV/AIDS	Population Council
National Committee for Maternal Health	Population Institute
National Confederation of Education Workers	Potohar Organisation for Development Assistance
National Council for Childhood and Motherhood	Potohar Organisation for Development Assistance
National Council of the Union of Burma	Pro Mujer
National Education Association	Profamilia
National Institute of Punjab Studies	Project Ploughshares
National Museum of Natural History in Paris	Public Citizen's Water for All Campaign
Network for Greater Involvement of People Living with HIV in the Fight Against AIDS	Public Services International
Network Institute for Global Democratisation	Reading Program to stop illiteracy
New Economics Foundation	Reproductive Choice Information Group
New Sudanese Indigenous NGOs Network	Reproductive Health Division
New York-based Disability Network	Reproductive Health for Motherhood Without Risk
No Borders	RESULTS International
North South Institute	Roll Back Malaria Partnership
One Planet Living	Save the Children
One World Action	SCN
Organisation of Women's Freedom in Iraq	Seatini
	Self Employed Womens Association
	Social Forum of the Americas

Five Views of Development: How news agencies cover the Millennium Development Goals

Social Justice Committee	The Cradle
Society for International Development	Housing Institute of the city of Buenos Aires
Socioeconomic Activity Support for Rural Women	Microcredit Summit Campaign
Solidar	Third World Network
SOS Corpo	Transparency International
South African Agricultural Research Council	Treatment Action Campaign
South African Council of Churches	Ubuntu
South African Institute of International Affairs	UPLIFT
South African Medical Association	Venezuelan Public Health Association
Southern African Migration Project	VERNO
Southern Caucus of NGOs for Sustainable Development	Women's Popular Education Network (REPEM)
Spanish Federation of Farmers' Organisations	Women's Social and Political Institute
St. Petersburg Crisis Centre	Working Group on Women, Peace and Security
State of the World project	World Conservation Union
Stockholm Environment Institute	World Council of Churches
Sustainable Development Network	World Development Movement
Sustainable Energy and Economy Network	World Ecology Economy and Development
Synodical Board of Health Services of the Church of North India	World Resources institute
Thai Labour Campaign	World Technology Network
The Citizen's Foundation (TCF)	

